

Regular Workshop – March 17, 2014
Agenda Item 6

- Agenda Item:** Discussion Regarding Level of Service for Solid Waste Collection
- Presenter:** Town Manager and Staff
- Summary:** Town staff has received and scored the proposals for solid waste collection services and now the Commission must select a level of service for single family (less than four units) collection.
- The RFP required proposals for our current collection system, plus two other options. One option is the same, but allows all recycling to be mixed in a single wheeled container. The other option is once per week garbage, once per week yard waste, once per week recycling. This option is a departure from the current garbage collection schedule.
- Attachments:** 3-7-14 Memo, Manager to Commission;
PowerPoint - Residential Service Options;
2-27-14 Memo, Public Works Director to Manager;
Evaluation Committee Points Tabulation.
- Recommended Action:** Pending discussion, provide direction to Manager.

MEMORANDUM

Date: March 07, 2014

TO: Town Commission
FROM: Dave Bullock, Town Manager
SUBJECT: Discussion Regarding Level of Service for Solid Waste Collection

We have received and scored the proposals for solid waste collection services and now must select a level of service for single family (less than four units) collection. Currently the Town provides twice per week garbage collection, once per week yard waste, and once per week recycling with separate bins for paper and containers (2-1-1 dual stream).

The RFP required proposals for our current collection system, plus two other options. One option is the same 2-1-1 but allows all recycling to be mixed in a single wheeled container (2-1-1 single stream). The other option is once per week garbage, once per week yard waste, once per week recycling (1-1-1). This option is a departure from the current garbage collection schedule.

The attached PowerPoint slides provide information and pros/cons on 2-1-1 vs. 1-1-1 and on single stream vs. dual stream recycling. Containers for the current dual stream and single stream recycling will be on hand at the March 17, 2014 Regular Workshop Meeting.

The redacted evaluation committee report is also attached to show cost implications for each option. I will follow the evaluation committee scoring and financial proposed scores in awarding the Franchise. The franchise will be brought to the Commission in the form of an ordinance for consideration at the April 7, 2014 Regular Meeting.

If the Commission decides to make a change in recycling collection type or garbage collection frequency there will be a need for a transition plan with a public information effort. These transitions have occurred in many communities but they take time and good communications. We will be prepared to discuss the transition experience in other communities.

Residential Services Options

- Residential Collection
 - 2-1-1, dual stream recycling
 - 2-1-1, single stream recycling
 - 1-1-1, single stream recycling



Decision Item: Single vs. Dual Stream Recycling

	Single Stream (65-gal cart)	Dual Stream (2 18-gal bins)
Pros:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 80% greater capacity • Increased participation and tonnage • Customer convenience • Less litter • Improved efficiency, worker safety • Savings to Town- ~\$40 in avoided disposal costs for each additional ton recycled 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No changes to current program • Less contamination
Cons:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education and outreach needed • Perceived space issues 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited capacity • Less convenient to take to curb



Decision Item: Single vs. Dual Stream Recycling



65-gallon cart
 $27'' \times 23'' = 460 \text{ in}^2$



2 18-gal. bins
 $2 \times (18'' \times 25'') = 900 \text{ in}^2$

51% smaller footprint,
29 gallons more capacity



Decision Item: 2-1-1 vs. 1-1-1 Collection

	1-1-1 Collection Service	2-1-1 Collection Service
Pros:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All collection on the same day • Encourages recycling • Less truck traffic • Less fuel use, GHG emissions • Lower cost 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No change to current level of service • Convenience of additional pick-up day
Cons:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residents may request extra carts • Education and outreach needed • Perceived odor issues 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More truck traffic • More fuel use, GHG emissions • Multiple collection days per week

Industry Trend toward 1-1-1:

More than 4.13 million Florida residents currently have once per week garbage collection



MEMORANDUM

Date: February 27, 2014

TO: Dave Bullock, Town Manager
FROM: Juan Florensa, Public Works Director
SUBJECT: Solid Waste Collection Services Franchise –
Request for Proposals #14-004

In accordance with the Town's Purchasing Code, you appointed the following individuals to serve on the Professional Services Review Committee for Solid Waste Collection Services:

- Susan Smith, Town of Longboat Key Finance Director
- Monica Bramble, City of North Port Solid Waste Manager
- Juan Florensa, Town of Longboat Key Public Works Director

The Professional Services Review Committee met on Friday, February 21, 2014 to discuss the proposals and ask questions of the responders. The committee, after an approximate 45-minute interview process with each firm, individually evaluated each firm on two weighted criteria:

1. Qualifications, experience and references (15 point maximum)
2. Technical proposals, including exceptions (25 point maximum)

The three responding firms are:

1. Progressive Waste Solutions
2. Waste Pro of Florida, Inc.
3. Waste Management Inc. of Florida

Individual evaluation committee member points for qualifications, experience, references and technical proposal were averaged. Points for financial proposals were determined by the formula as specified in the RFP. The averaged points awarded by the committee were then added to the financial proposal to produce a total score for each service option.

The three service options presented are:

Option 1: 2-1-1 Dual Stream Collection (Status Quo). Should the Town select this option, the Town requires the Franchisee maintain the current collection schedule.

- a. Residential Solid Waste – Twice per week, on Monday and Thursday, collection in Franchisee-provided and maintained 96-gallon Garbage Carts, with 65-gallon or 32-gallon Garbage Carts available upon request. Collection is unlimited; Residential Users may purchase additional Garbage Carts for a one-time fee of sixty dollars (\$60.00).

- b. Program Recyclables – Once per week collection, on Monday, of Dual Stream Recyclables in Franchisee-provided and maintained 18-gallon Recycling Bins.
- c. Residential Yard Trash – Once per week, on Wednesday, collection of containerized, bagged or bundled Yard Trash. Resident-provided containers or bags may not weigh more than forty (40) pounds and limbs and branches may not exceed 4 feet in length, or forty (40) pounds in weight.
- d. Residential Bulk Waste – On-call collection within seven (7) calendar days of request by a Residential User. This service does not apply to large clean-outs as associated with vacancies or other similar events. The Franchisee may provide these services on a non-exclusive basis at competitive rates outside of the Agreement.

Option 2: 2-1-1 Single Stream Collection. Should the Town select this option, the Town requires the Franchisee maintain the current collection schedule as provided in Option 1.

- a. Residential Solid Waste – Same as Option 1.
- b. Program Recyclables – Once per week collection, on Monday, of Single Stream Recyclables in Franchisee-provided and maintained 64-gallon Recycling Carts, with 96-gallon and 32-gallon Recycling Carts available upon request at no additional charge to the Town or Residential User.
- c. Residential Yard Trash – Same as Option 1.
- d. Residential Bulk Waste – Same as Option 1.

Option 3: 1-1-1 Single Stream Collection. Should the Town select this option, the Town requires the Franchisee conduct collections on the schedule as specified herein.

- a. Residential Solid Waste – Once per week collection, on Monday or Thursday, in Franchisee-provided and maintained 96-gallon Garbage Carts, with 65-gallon or 32-gallon Garbage Carts available upon request. Collection is unlimited; Residential Users may purchase additional Garbage Carts for a one-time fee of sixty dollars (\$60.00).
- b. Program Recyclables – Same as Option 2.
- c. Residential Yard Trash – Same as Options 1 and 2.
- d. Residential Bulk Waste – Same as Options 1 and 2.

The attachments contained herein show each committee member's individual scoring, averaged score, financial proposal scores (calculated) for each collection option.

This information may be used by you and the Town Commission in the policy decision regarding service options for level of service for residential customers.

Town of Longboat Key RFP 14-004 Point Tabulation

Individual Evaluation Committee member points for qualifications/experience/references and technical proposal were averaged. Points for financial proposals were determined by formula as specified in the RFP, using prices rounded to the nearest cent. Points for qualifications/experience/references, technical proposal, and financial proposal were then added to produce a total score for each service option. Selection of a service option will be made by the Town Commission, which is a policy decision, and might not be based solely on price.

Evaluation Committee Scores	Company A				Company B				Company C			
	JF	MB	SS	AVG	JF	MB	SS	AVG	JF	MB	SS	AVG
Qualifications, Experience & References (max 15 points)	15.00	15.00	14.00	14.67	15.00	15.00	15.00	15.00	14.00	15.00	13.00	14.00
Technical Proposal (max 25 points)	15.00	20.00	25.00	20.00	20.00	23.00	25.00	22.67	21.00	25.00	23.00	23.00
TOTAL				34.67				37.67				37.00

Financial Proposal Scores					
OPTION 1 (2-1-1 Dual Stream)			60.00	59.33	58.46
OPTION 2 (2-1-1 Single Stream)			60.00	58.19	57.42
OPTION 3 (1-1-1 Single Stream)			58.56	59.27	60.00

TOTAL SCORES					
OPTION 1 (2-1-1 Dual Stream)			94.67	97.00	95.46
OPTION 2 (2-1-1 Single Stream)			94.67	95.86	94.42
OPTION 3 (1-1-1 Single Stream)			93.23	96.94	97.00

Town of Longboat Key RFP 14-004 Financial Proposal Points

All pricing, including "Current" estimates, is based on the unit counts provided in RFP 14-004, which were provided for RFP purposes only. Actual pricing will be based on actual unit counts and recovered material values each month. As specified on the Financial Proposal Form provided in the RFP, all prices were to be rounded to the nearest cent. All pricing below is based on rounding unit prices to the nearest cent; therefore, where differences occur between the pricing below and that provided in the proposer's submittal, it is noted.

	Current	Company A	Company B	Company C
OPTION 1 (2-1-1 Dual Stream)				
Residential Service (\$/Unit)	\$ 19.53	\$ 11.99	\$ 15.07	\$ 14.25
Residential Service Annual Total	\$ 516,083.52	\$ 304,319.04	\$ 363,318.72	\$ 381,829.92
Commercial Service Annual Total	\$ 1,032,178.92	\$ 790,683.48	\$ 735,806.28	\$ 738,900.24
Est. Annual Recyclables Revenue	\$ -	\$ 13,413.00	\$ 5,363.50	\$ 10,727.00
TOTAL ANNUAL COST	\$ 1,548,262.44	\$ 1,081,589.52	\$ 1,093,761.50	\$ 1,110,003.16
Points (max 60)		60.00	59.33	58.46

OPTION 2 (2-1-1 Single Stream)				
Residential Service (\$/Unit)	NA	\$ 11.99	\$ 15.96	\$ 15.09
Residential Service Annual Total	NA	\$ 304,319.04	\$ 384,764.16	\$ 402,070.56
Commercial Service Annual Total	NA	\$ 790,683.48	\$ 735,806.28	\$ 738,900.24
Est. Annual Recyclables Revenue	NA	\$ 13,413.00	\$ 5,363.50	\$ 10,727.00
TOTAL ANNUAL COST	NA	\$ 1,081,589.52	\$ 1,115,206.94	\$ 1,130,243.80
Points (max 60)		60.00	58.19	57.42

OPTION 3 (1-1-1 Single Stream)				
Residential Service (\$/Unit)	NA	\$ 11.99	\$ 14.02	\$ 11.99
Residential Service Annual Total	NA	\$ 304,319.04	\$ 338,017.92	\$ 327,372.96
Commercial Service Annual Total	NA	\$ 790,683.48	\$ 735,806.28	\$ 738,900.24
Est. Annual Recyclables Revenue	NA	\$ 13,413.00	\$ 5,363.50	\$ 10,727.00
TOTAL ANNUAL COST	NA	\$ 1,081,589.52	\$ 1,068,460.70	\$ 1,055,546.20
Points (max 60)		58.56	59.27	60.00



End of Agenda Item